# Southern Regional Model United Nations XXII Addressing the global financial crisis: Restoring economic stability through international solidarity

November 17-19, 2011. Atlanta, GA

Email: sc@srmun.org



## Honorable Delegates,

It is my honor to welcome you to Southern Regional Model United Nations (SRMUN) XXII. My name is Lee Boswell, and I will serve as your Director for the United Nations Security Council (UNSC). Joining me at the dais this year is Heather Hendon-Sigley, who will serve as your Assistant-Director. We are both very excited and honored to be serving the UNSC.

We are very pleased to be simulating the UNSC at SRMUN XXII. It is one of the few bodies within the entire United Nations that has the ability to pass binding resolutions, and it is the only body that can give military orders. Member States that are composed of the UNSC have a firm responsibility to address some of the most critical and time-sensitive emergency matters facing the international community. The UNSC is also unique in its rules of procedure, and especially in its voting procedure. We encourage you to review and familiarize yourself with these rules before the conference. These rules can be found on the SRMUN website. The UNSC has an open agenda, which means that any Member State can propose to discuss any topic they wish. For your convenience, Heather and I have put together five topics that you may use during your selection of the agenda:

- I. Cyber Warfare
- II. Addressing the Security Situation in Middle East
- III. Examining the Practicality and Effectiveness of Sanctions
- IV. Climate Change and International Security
- V. Examining Challenges Facing the Development of Nuclear Energy

Each delegation of the UNSC must submit a position paper that covers three topics of their choosing. This can include both topics from the proposed list above, or a topic that is of important to your Member State. Position papers are used to state your position on the topic, outlines a potential course of action, and can be used to inform other Members of your positions.

Position papers should be viewed as an opportunity for delegates to research and begin building a base of knowledge of each topic. Well-developed position papers are factual, informative, and persuasive. Papers should be no more than 2 pages in length, single-spaced. More detailed information, including format specifications and writing tips, can be found at (<a href="https://www.srmun.org">www.srmun.org</a>. Position papers MUST be submitted by October 30<sup>th</sup>, 11:59pm EST via the on-line submission system at <a href="https://www.srmun.org">https://www.srmun.org</a>.

Heather and I look forward to working with you over the coming months, and to serving on the UNSC for SRMUN XXII. In researching, please do not hesitate to contact any of us with questions or concerns. We look forward to working with you in November.

Lee Boswell Director sc@srmun.org Heather Hendon-Sigley Assistant Director sc@srmun.org Reggie Thomas Director-General dg@srmun.org

# **Committee History of the United Nations Security Council**

The Security Council, created under Article V of the United Nations Charter in 1945, <sup>1</sup> is unique in its ability to pass binding resolutions on Member States of the United Nations (UN). While the United Nations General Assembly seems to be the epicenter of diplomacy and policymaking, its resolutions are non-binding on Member States and thus they must recommend to the Security Council items deemed threatening in order to achieve a binding mandate. As the body of the UN that is relegated to maintaining and protecting international peace and security, it is necessary for the Security Council to respond to new and immediate crises, but also to act to ensure lasting peace throughout the world. Thus, this body may be called upon to meet at any time, day or night, to handle international threats, in which the Security Council will produce detailed and measured resolutions designed to mitigate immediate concerns to international security as well as to set up a lasting peace after the crisis has passed. Understanding the make-up and duties of this body is essential when taking part in a simulation of this type.

## Voting and Membership

As per the UN Charter, there are fifteen Member States assigned to the Security Council. There are five permanent members, called the P5 informally, and ten non-permanent members that are elected every two years by the UN General Assembly. (The P5 consist of the People's Republic of China, France, the Russian Federation, the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, and the United States of America. Originally, China was represented by the Republic of China in Taiwan, and Russia was the Union of Soviet Socialist Republic). As of August 2010, the non-permanent members are: Bosnia and Herzegovina, Brazil, Colombia, Gabon, Germany, India, Lebanon, Nigeria, Portugal, and South Africa. Recently, there has been an increase in the involvement of non-Members and non-governmental organizations in Security Council deliberations, as well as an increase in the involvement from other UN bodies. The UN Charter also allows for the participation of non-member States if their interests are "specially affected" and/or they are "party to a dispute under consideration."

Voting is also unique in the Security Council. While all Member States have an equal voice in the other bodies of the UN, the Security Council allows the permanent members a veto. Thus, should a member of the P5 vote against a resolution, it becomes null and void, regardless of the number of affirmative votes it may receive. Veto aside, both procedural and substantive decisions require nine affirmative votes to pass. This system has been called into question on numerous occasions due to the inequality it represents. The veto also prevents swift and decisive action on occasion since Member States will often capitulate terms in order to avoid the veto and this can delay and/or quell mandates that could have prevented mass casualties. Critics calling for reform call the veto an impediment to timely and effective action by the UN in response to complex emergencies and large-scale human rights abuses as well as an inaccurate reflection of the balance of economic and military power and population in today's international climate.

The Security Council may also establish "such subsidiary organs as it deems necessary for the performance of its functions." Examples of these subsidiary bodies include the Counter Terrorism Committee, the Resolution 1540 Committee (a body that addresses non-proliferation), and the International Criminal Tribunals for the Former Yugoslavia and Rwanda. The Security Council may also determine its own rules of procedure. The Presidency of the Security Council rotates on a monthly basis with each member taking a turn and chosen alphabetically. Understanding the procedural aspects of the Security Council helps to understand how it carries out its main duties and uses its power.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Charter of the United Nations. The United Nations. June 26, 1945. <a href="http://www.un.org/en/documents/charter/chapter5.shtml">http://www.un.org/en/documents/charter/chapter5.shtml</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> "Membership in 2011." The United Nations. <a href="http://www.un.org/sc/members.asp">http://www.un.org/sc/members.asp</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Charter of the United Nations. The United Nations. June 26, 1945. <a href="http://www.un.org/en/documents/charter/chapter5.shtml">http://www.un.org/en/documents/charter/chapter5.shtml</a>. <a href="http://www.un.org/en/documents/charter/chapter5.shtml">http://www.un.org/en/documents/chapter5.shtml</a>. <a href="http://

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Bardo Fassbender. *Pressure for Security Council Reform*.London: Lynne Rienner Publishers. 2004, p. 345.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Ibid., pp. 351-352

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> A/59/2005. In Larger Freedom: Towards Development, Security and Human Rights For All.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Charter of the United Nations. The United Nations. June 26, 1945. <a href="http://www.un.org/en/documents/charter/chapter5.shtml">http://www.un.org/en/documents/charter/chapter5.shtml</a>

<sup>11</sup> Ibid.

## Main Duties and Powers

Customarily the role of the Security Council has been to handle hard security topics such as cross-border invasions, non-proliferation, and terrorism. Recently the Security Council has broadened its scope to include soft security topics such as human rights, women & children in combat, and the role of HIV/AIDS in peace and security. The broadening of the Council's scope allows the UN to merge its core purposes of peace and security not just for Member States but for individual human security and development. <sup>12</sup> The other less mentioned role of the Security Council is to make recommendations to the General Assembly of new Member States and candidates for Secretary-General. <sup>13</sup>

A thorough reading of the UN Charter fully delineates the role of the Security Council as follows: Chapter VI authorizes the Council to respond to international threats to peace and security in a diplomatic arena. In this way it investigates perceived threats, analyzes potential outcomes and makes recommendations to mitigate those concerns; Chapter VII empowers the Security Council with the right to enforce its decisions, making its resolutions binding on Member States, whether through military or economic actions. He while peacekeeping and peacebuilding are not part of its official mandate, the Security Council has grown to include such issues on its agenda. Dag Hammarskjöld once called this evolution of power "Chapter VI ½ power" as it falls somewhere between traditional diplomatic dispute resolution methods and forceful measures. Is

Thus the Security Council may be the most significant body within the UN system. Not only does the Council now practice peacekeeping, in the form of ceasefire monitoring, establishing the mandates of peacekeeping forces, and peacebuilding with a contingent of troops numbering 124,000 in sixteen deployment arenas, it still maintains the original mandate of peace and security whenever a crisis erupts. Ready to be called upon at a moment's notice, the Security Council must be prepared to effectively and efficiently solve the world's greatest threats. Despite numerous cries for reform, it is still the only body within the UN that has the power to enact binding policy on the Member States.

The Members of the Security Council are: BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA, BRAZIL, CHINA, COLOMBIA, FRANCE, GABON, GERMANY, INDIA, LEBANON, NIGERIA, PORTUGAL, RUSSIAN FEDERATION, SOUTH AFRICA, UNITED KINGDOM, and the UNITED STATES.

# I: Cyber Warfare

"We are now living in the midst of the third great revolution in history. When the principle of the lever was applied to make a plow, the agricultural revolution was born, and the power of nomadic tribal chiefs declined. When centuries later, men substituted the power of water, steam, and electricity for animal muscle, the Industrial Revolution was born. Both of these massive changes took centuries to unfold. Each caused a shift in the power structure. Today, the marriage of computers and telecommunications has ushered in the Information Age, which is as different from the Industrial Age as that period was from the Agricultural Age. Information technology has demolished time and distance."

WALTER B. WRISTON, Former Chairman and Chief Executive Officer of Citicorp/Citibank, served as Chairman of the Economic Policy Advisory Board in the Reagan administration

Considered the Fifth Domain of Battle by the US Pentagon, cyber warfare has been considered a threat for the last 20 years. <sup>17</sup> However, cyber warfare has been a rarely practiced, poorly defined and widely misunderstood form of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> United Nations Security Council. *Resolutions*: 1261, 1999; 1308, 2000; 1820, 2008.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Charter of the United Nations. The United Nations. June 26, 1945. <a href="http://www.un.org/en/documents/charter/chapter5.shtml">http://www.un.org/en/documents/charter/chapter5.shtml</a>
<sup>14</sup> Ibid

<sup>15 &</sup>quot;60 Years United Nations Peacekeeping." United Nations Information Service.

http://www.unis.unvienna.org/pdf/60years\_peacekeeping.pdf

16 "United Nations Peacekeeping." United Nations Department of Public Information.

http://www.un.org/en/peacekeeping/documents/backgroundnote.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Stuart Fox. "Cyberwar: Definition, Hype & Reality." Innovation News Daily. July 8, 2011 <a href="http://www.livescience.com/14965-cyberwar-definition-cyber-war.html">http://www.livescience.com/14965-cyberwar-definition-cyber-war.html</a>

conflict in the past decade throughout the world. With the discovery of Stuxnet, the computer worm deployed to eliminate a fifth of Iran's nuclear centrifuges, the world is realizing that cyber warfare is quickly becoming the face of modern warfare.

The difference between traditional warfare and cyber warfare is the intangibility of a cyber-attack which can lead to precise destruction or devastation on the level of a weapon of mass destruction (WMD.) Which is unlike traditional warfare when the attack is immediately understood and the threat can be identified either from point of origin or from forensics. Cyber-attacks can go unnoticed and be untraceable, and thus pose a threat unlike any other. They can be used against military operations, infrastructure and communications as well as civilian installations and infrastructures. The resulting destruction can be catastrophic.<sup>20</sup>

Today's wars are fought on digital battlefields. The use of satellite imagery and positioning, unmanned aircraft and remote controlled tanks has changed the way war is waged.<sup>21</sup> The precision with which targets are attacked and the removal of soldiers from the frontlines has made war a much less deadly pastime. Sure, people still die and many are wounded, but the casualties from protracted conflict in which technology is a primary tool are astronomically lower than those which do not. The benefits of technology cannot be ignored when human lives are at stake. But, what happens when the networks that are intended to keep soldiers and civilians safe are hijacked by a cyber-attack? Nor can the continued pursuit of bigger and better weapons by not only developed states, but also the determination of lesser developed states in an effort to balance the scales between the weak and the strong. Traditionally, the high cost of entry has been enough to bar these states from being able to achieve their goals. Cyber warfare provides a low cost and effective alternative. It would be a fair assumption to conclude that all nations are currently developing their cyber capabilities.

The difference between cyber warfare and cyber terrorism is that one is a planned attack by a State against another State while the other is an attack by a non-state actor against non-combatants. Cyber warfare to date is loosely recognized as a strategic attack against another State's information systems, computer programs, and data that results in military loss, human or otherwise. The attack can be one of reconnaissance, vandalism, and/or sabotage. Cyber terrorism may take any of those forms, but their targets are not military. Therefore it is highly likely that an anti-government group or an anti-world trade or some other group could and would use such an attack to disrupt civilian communication servers, financial institutions and even power grids or other such infrastructure systems that are now connected to cyber space. It is feasible for an attack to disrupt water supplies, traffic control, and so much more. So, while cyber-warfare is aimed primarily against a State's military and governmental machinery, cyber-terrorism is aimed at the civilian population. By its very nature cyber-warfare is expected by both sides during conflict whereas cyber terrorism is a blind attack.

While by definition warfare must be declared, there are several instances where a State has employed a cyber-attack against another State outside of conflict and without declaration. The difficulty in tracking the origin of such an attack makes them appealing to many States. Once again, the low cost and limited resources needed to carry out such an attack also come into play. A state, and/or terrorist, needs only a computer, an internet connection and time. Very little else is needed to perpetrate such an action. AS technology progresses there will be an increase in cyberattack and only the size and scope of the attack will hint at who the perpetrator could be, making it a viable and fundamental component of all National Security strategies. Like the Cold War and its arms race, the international community is heading into a cyber-arms race, and the results could have lasting and crippling effects not only on the peace and stability of the world as we know it but also on the world economy that is still weak and recovering from the last crisis.

As of now, the Geneva Conventions, which address people in war, and the Hague Conventions, which address war itself, may not fully address the issues of cyber warfare, considering they were conceived before cyber space was a reality. Furthermore, the lack of a clear definition of not just what constitutes a cyber-attack but also boundaries

19 William J. Broad. "Israeli Test on Worm Called Crucial in Iran Nuclear Delay." New York Times. January 15<sup>th</sup>, 2011. http://www.nytimes.com/2011/01/16/world/middleeast/16stuxnet.html?pagewanted=all 20 Jonathan Masters. "Confronting the Cyber Threat." Council on Foreign Relations. May 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2011.

<sup>20</sup> Jonathan Masters. "Confronting the Cyber Threat." Council on Foreign Relations. May 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2011 <a href="http://www.cfr.org/technology-and-foreign-policy/confronting-cyber-threat/p15577">http://www.cfr.org/technology-and-foreign-policy/confronting-cyber-threat/p15577</a>

<sup>21</sup> Walter Wriston. "Bits, Bytles, and Diplomacy." Foreign Affairs. September 1997. http://bss.sfsu.edu/fischer/IR%20305/Readings/bits.htm

<sup>18</sup> Ibid

within cyberspace itself and the proliferation of non-state actors makes the issue hard to fit into any existing international laws, customary or otherwise. The Geneva Conventions do make a provision for wanton and extensive destruction of property of a non-military nature and consider such a grave breach; however, the Geneva Conventions only mitigate actions between Member States that are party to the conventions and qualify as lawful combatants.<sup>22</sup> The additional protocol provides for an attack which makes civilians the object of the attack and/or launching an indiscriminate attack that affects civilians a grave breach.<sup>23</sup> The question becomes one of whether or not the language contained within these documents, and considered customary international law by most Member States, is enough to contain and adjudicate the use of cyber warfare. The Hague Conventions were an attempt to ban the use of modern technology from warfare in an attempt to make war more humane. Within the convention the laws of war are defined, requiring a commanding officer and subordinates, a fixed distinctive emblem recognizable at a distance, the open carrying of arms, and the obeisance to the laws and customs of war within their operations; however, is this possible and applicable to cyberspace?<sup>24</sup> Furthermore, these conventions do not apply to non-state actors, leaving terrorist groups and hackers in a loophole of international law.

Recently, S/RES/1989 (2011), which deals with terrorism, mentions in operative clause six that the provision of internet services to known terrorist groups is an offense, making those who do eligible for sanctions, this represents what is currently on the books regarding cyber warfare.<sup>25</sup> The protection of the internet from terrorists is important, even essential, yet the mere fact that we have become a global society connected and dependent on the Internet begs the question "Is it enough?" The immense size and integration of cyberspace into every aspect of daily life, seen and unseen, is where the vulnerability lies. In 2001 the Council of Europe signed The Convention on Cybercrime in Europe. 26 The first of its kind, this convention deals with cyber-crime in an international legal forum which has yet to be copied by the rest of the international community. While providing definitions of terms and crimes under the convention and determining who is liable for said offenses, it is solely related to cyber-crime, and therefore may only be used to help guide international efforts on cyber warfare, but cannot adequately address the issue at hand.

There are three primary vehicles available for cyber-attack. They include computer hacking, which is the intentional unauthorized accessing of a computer system or network for the purpose of obtaining information, disseminating information and/or propaganda, or monitoring the system in order to ascertain weaknesses and/or hijack said network.<sup>27</sup> The second is introduction of a virus, worm or Trojan. A virus is a code that is attached to a computer file. As the file moves from one computer to another, the code infiltrates a computer and causes damage. 28 Å worm is similar to a virus, except that it automatically moves from one computer to another. <sup>29</sup> A Trojan horse, given its name from Greek mythology, is a virus that is disguised as useful software that is installed onto a computer.<sup>30</sup> The third is through pre-infected electronic components. This is a supply chain attack that embeds electronic components with the ability for an outside host to obtain access to whatever system the component is installed within. The embedded material may be in the form of a program, microchip or deliberate flaw designed to disable.<sup>31</sup>

In 2007 Estonia experienced a cyber-war that was unprecedented in its very scope and size. 32 The attack targeted the presidency of Estonia, the government's ministries, political parties, the top three news agencies, the two biggest banks, and its telecommunications providers.<sup>33</sup> Clearly, as the immensity of this attack proves, the UNSC must be proactive and set up definitions, regulations and parameters for Cyber Warfare.

http://www.microsoft.com/nz/digitallife/security/what are computer viruses.mspx# <sup>29</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Geneva Convention. August 12, 1949.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> The Avalon Project, Laws of War: Hague IV 10/18/1907, Art IV annex Ch I Art I, http://avalon.law.yale.edu/20th\_century/hague04.asp

S/RES/1989 (2011). United Nations Security Council. June 17, 2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> "Council of Europe: Convention on Cyber Crime." International Legal Materials. Vol. 41, No. 2. Pp. 282-302

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> "Computer Hacking Law & Legal Definition." US Legal.com.http://definitions.uslegal.com/c/computer-hacking/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> "What are computer viruses." Microsoft New Zealand.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Michael Santo. "Tomorrow's Cyberwarfare may be carried out by pre-infected electronics: DHS," Examiner, July 8, 2011. http://www.examiner.com/technology-in-national/tomorrow-s-cyberwarfare-may-be-carried-out-by-pre-infected-electronics-dhs <sup>32</sup> "Estonia hit by 'Moscrow cyber war." BBC News. May 17, 2007. http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/europe/6665145.stm 33 Ibid.

## **Documented Attacks**

The very vastness of the Internet creates vulnerable loopholes that hackers exploit. Some of these documented attacks are known as "Moonlight Maze," "Nimda," and "Slammer." Hackers can use a variety of tools to infiltrate a system, using only a computer and an Internet connection. Most often they exploit vulnerabilities in a system to obtain information, other times they install viruses.

"Moonlight Maze" was a security breach where intruders attained secret information from United States entities such as the "Pentagon, NASA, Energy Department, private universities and research labs." Tens of thousands of military files, including troop confirmations and hardware designs were browsed for more than two years. An investigation showed that the attack came from a computer in Russia. The Nimda worm occurred shortly after the September 11<sup>th</sup>, 2011 terrorist attacks on the United States. The worm, which is "admin" spelled backwards, had a widespread opportunities to infect computers through email, web sites, and computer servers. It slowed millions of computers and caused large blockages in internet traffic. Although the timing was considered to be suspicious, it was not believed to have been related to the terrorist attacks.

More recently, McAfee, an anti-virus company revealed that the United States and other States were attacked for more than five years. 38 Although McAfee did not name the attacker, they noted that they believed one "state actor" was behind these events. The 72 "victims" were from a wide array of sectors, including governments, corporations and other organizations. 39 McAfee's vice-president of threat research noted, "What we have witnessed over the past five to six years has been nothing short of a historically unprecedented transfer of wealth – closely guarded national secrets, source code, bug databases, email archives, negotiation plans and exploration details for new oil and gas field auctions.... And much more has 'fallen off the truck' of numerous, mostly Western companies and disappeared in the ever-growing electronic archives of dogged adversaries."40

Although many of the attacks referred to in the prior paragraphs have been malicious attempts to gain unlawful admission to information, there have been instances where States have employed cyber attacks for what they believe to be their own security. Stuxnet, a highlysophisticated worm, was used against Iran's nuclear program in an effort to thwart its ability to enrich uranium for weapon production. Hother to shutting down a fifth of its centrifuges and delaying Iran's nuclear program, the attack seemingly stems from a cooperative effort of the U.S. and Israel, though there is no definitive proof of their involvement. Having two major components, first the worm was designed to disrupt the nuclear centrifuges by spinning them out of control and the second secretly recorded what normal operations at the nuclear plant looked like, in order to replay to the plant operators, making it appear as if everything was operating normally while in fact the centrifuges were actually tearing themselves apart.

## Conclusion

Clearly, the rules have changed in traditional State to State conflict. Therefore the UNSC must address the issues involved. Consider the possible humanitarian aspects that coincide with cyber warfare and cyber terrorism. The cost, both human and capital, is rising for traditional warfare, and much of the world has been advocating for the abandonment of nuclear weapons as well as all weapons of mass destruction (WMD). In lieu of perpetual peace among Member States, they must turn to alternatives when conflict arises, the most likely new method of battle will be Cyber, which, as mentioned before, is cheaper, more efficient and requires less human resources. The ability to purchase components such as high-speed transmitters and receivers is available and abundant to all. Although there

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> "Cyber War!" Frontline PBS, 2003, http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/frontline/shows/cyberwar/warnings/

<sup>35</sup> Ibid.

<sup>36</sup> Ibid.

<sup>37</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Suzanne Choney. "US was chief target of cyber attacks: McAfee." MSNBC.com August 2011.
<a href="http://technolog.msnbc.msn.com/">http://technolog.msnbc.msn.com/</a> news/2011/08/03/7239686-us-was-chief-target-of-cyber-attacks-mcafee
<sup>39</sup> Ihid

<sup>40</sup> Ibid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> William J. Broad. "Israeli Test on Worm Called Crucial in Iran Nuclear Delay." New York Times. January 15<sup>th</sup>, 2011. http://www.nytimes.com/2011/01/16/world/middleeast/16stuxnet.html?pagewanted=all

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Ibid.

are some existing export controls, they merely slow down sales, they do not prohibit the movement of materials or expertise. Even with the sale of super-computers restricted, it has been determined that only a combination of computers, network gear, and software is needed to build a "super-computer" capable of exacting the same computing power as a true super-computer, and in the wrong hands can lead to devastation. The world has already seen threats to civilian infrastructures and communications, and should an attack occur, the resulting humanitarian crises would be on a scale unseen before.

Leading experts expect attacks to be directed at the supply chain and the possibility of these attacks or sabotage from the use of pre-infected components. "The challenge with supply chain attacks is that a sophisticated adversary might narrowly focus on particular systems and make manipulation virtually impossible to discover." While it seems that foreign manufacturing presents easier opportunities for States to subvert components, the same goals can be achieved by recruiting key people within manufacturing centers for espionage or subversion purposes from outside the State. 45

Cyber warfare is a real and imminent threat to international peace and security, as well as the global financial system. Problems arise from the lack of State boundaries within cyber space and the increased reliance on cyber space for daily life, from the international to the single user. Any attack which paralyzes a network, military, financial, or civilian, would have exponentially high humanitarian repercussions. It would be a natural response in the face of such a threat for Member States to actively develop cyber armies in an attempt to defend against said threat. In the past, boundaries have been determined by geographical factors, yet in cyber space no such boundaries exist. Furthermore, can a Member State's sovereignty be determined merely by its geography in today's world?

The reality of cyber warfare also will be yet another aspect of the divide between developed and lesser developed States, as most of the super-computer servers that provide IP addresses are in English, and three of the currently online thirteen are owned by the United States. The distribution of networks is highly imbalanced, as many Western States have networks that are huge in comparison to entire developing regions, especially when viewed at the per capita level. Leaving developing countries at risk of being coopted by developed states for protective services in exchange for natural resources or at risk of turning to non-state actors or the black market for such protection is not in the best interest of the international community.

#### **Committee Directive**

Is defining boundaries in cyber space necessary to maintain international peace and security? Considering how interrelated cyber space has become, what defines civilian and non-civilian infrastructure? Should there be separate considerations for LDCs? Is it necessary to consider cyber armies themselves a threat and therefore call for the disarming of them, or should they be regulated like traditional armies? What about international monitoring and regulation of cyber space? Can current laws be modified to handle cyber warfare, or should there be a convention to create new legislation on the issue? Should a separate organization be developed to deal with the issue, including the monitoring and regulating of Cyber space? And, considering that many Member States may insist upon the need to keep such attacks from public knowledge in order to protect their own National Security, how can the International community maintain assistance and sovereignty in such an event?

# II: Addressing the Security Situation in Middle East

"Let us send a clear message to all the leaders. Protect your people. Listen more attentively to the voices of your people...What we have seen during the last several months in the Arab world is that the leaders are coming with too little and too late. They simply do not understand what people really want to have." —

UN Secretary-General Ban Ki-moon<sup>46</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Michael Santo. "Tomorrow's Cyberwarfare may be carried out by pre-infected electronics: DHS." Examiner. July 8, 2011. <a href="http://www.examiner.com/technology-in-national/tomorrow-s-cyberwarfare-may-be-carried-out-by-pre-infected-electronics-dhs">http://www.examiner.com/technology-in-national/tomorrow-s-cyberwarfare-may-be-carried-out-by-pre-infected-electronics-dhs</a>
<a href="http://www.examiner.com/technology-in-national/tomorrow-s-cyberwarfare-may-be-carried-out-by-pre-infected-electronics-dhs">http://www.examiner.com/technology-in-national/tomorrow-s-cyberwarfare-may-be-carried-out-by-pre-infected-electronics-dhs</a>
<a href="http://www.examiner.com/technology-in-national/tomorrow-s-cyberwarfare-may-be-carried-out-by-pre-infected-electronics-dhs">http://www.examiner.com/technology-in-national/tomorrow-s-cyberwarfare-may-be-carried-out-by-pre-infected-electronics-dhs</a>
<a href="http://www.examiner.com/technology-in-national/tomorrow-s-cyberwarfare-may-be-carried-out-by-pre-infected-electronics-dhs">http://www.examiner.com/technology-in-national/tomorrow-s-cyberwarfare-may-be-carried-out-by-pre-infected-electronics-dhs</a>
<a href="http://www.examiner.com/technology-in-national/tomorrow-s-cyberwarfare-may-be-carried-out-by-pre-infected-electronics-dhs">http://www.examiner.com/technology-in-national/tomorrow-s-cyberwarfare-may-be-carried-out-by-pre-infected-electronics-dhs</a>
<a href="http://www.examiner.com/technology-in-national/tomorrow-s-cyberwarfare-may-be-carried-out-by-pre-infected-electronics-dhs">http://www.examiner.com/technology-in-national/tomorrow-s-cyberwarfare-may-be-carried-out-by-pre-infected-electronics-dhs</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> "Winds of Change: North Africa and the Middle East." UN News Centre.

## Introduction

The area known as the Middle East has been a recurring theme of debate for the United Nations Security Council (UNSC). However, the situation in the region became more complicated in the past year with the arrival of the "Arab Spring." The Arab Spring actually began in December of 2010 when protests began in the North African state of Tunisia. 47 Protests then spread throughout the region reaching nearly every Arab country. On February 11, 2011, Egypt's president Hosni Mubarak stepped down as the country's president. The fall of Mubarak as well as the earlier success in Tunisia strengthened protesters who remained heavily active in Libya, Syria, Bahrain and Yemen. 48 The international community remained active throughout the early part of the Arab Spring, encouraging the hope of more democratic elements while also acknowledging sovereignty and stability. The Arab Spring did not begin bloodlessly as governments began to respond to protests in a variety of ways. Nevertheless, the security situation did not escalate until the fall of President Mubarak in Egypt and the outbreak of hostilities in Libya and Yemen. The military became the interim leader of Egypt and concerns over human rights as well as the stability of the largest Arab state heightened international concerns. The protests in Libya evolved into a full-fledged civil war as military units defected and joined others against the regime of Muammar Al-Gaddafi. <sup>49</sup> Likewise, security issues were present in Yemen as opposition groups broke down throughout the state. Additionally, concerns over the possibility that the Arab Spring had offered terrorist groups a chance to grow and strengthen was also raised.<sup>50</sup> The current situation has improved very little. Libvan opposition forces continue to battle pro-Gaddafi forces throughout the country, making gains with the help of the North Atlantic Treaty Organization's (NATO) bombing operations and a no-fly zone put in place by the UNSC.<sup>51</sup> Yemen's president Ali Abdullah Saleh was wounded in an attack on the presidential palace forcing him to seek treatment in nearby Saudi Arabia.<sup>52</sup> Finally, protests strengthened in Syria which created a humanitarian crisis as Syrians fleeing the violence crossed the border into Turkey.<sup>53</sup> Some news agencies also reported military units fighting against pro-Assad forces. Along with the Arab Spring, there remains conflict in the Sudan as the south attempts to peacefully secede following a popular referendum. Fighting for nominal control continues in Somalia, as a cohesive government has not been formed since an institutional collapse in 1991.<sup>54</sup> The multiple conflicts pose a significant issue for the international community.

As a result, this topic brings the issue of Middle East security before the body. There are many different issues within the debate but these can be organized into three separate security issues: civil war between government forces and opposition forces, humanitarian concerns, and the potential gains that terrorist and other non-state actors can achieve during the instability. These three can be applied to the situation throughout the Middle East including concerns in Sudan and Somalia.

## Civil War and the Potential for Conflict

The hope for a quick democratic solution in the Middle East crisis changed directions soon after it began.. As one commenter stated, "The Arab awakening is turning into the Arab nightmare. Instead of ushering in democracy, the uprisings in at least three Arab states are fast becoming vicious civil wars." Clashes between protesters and government forces began to become more violent and widespread and in some cases saw government forces defect

http://www.un.org/apps/news/infocusRel.asp?infocusID=129&Body=North+Africa&Body1=change

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Ryan Rifai. "Timeline: Tunisia's Uprising." Al Jazeera English. January 23, 2011.

http://english.aljazeera.net/indepth/spotlight/tunisia/2011/01/201114142223827361.html

<sup>48</sup> Charles Levinson, et al. "Fall of Mubarak Shakes Middle East." Wall Street Journal. February 23, 2011. http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052748703786804576137543866154926.html#project%3DMIDEASTUPRIS E110128%26articleTabs%3Darticle

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Jeremy Bowen. "Libya: The Story So Far." BBC News. August 16, 2011. http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-13860458
<sup>50</sup> Frank Gardner. "Is the Arab spring good or bad for terrorism?" BBC News. June 22, 2011. http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-middle-east-13878774

 <sup>51 &</sup>quot;Jeremy Bowen. "Libya: The Story So Far." BBC News. August 16, 2011. http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-13860458
 52 June 21, 2011. "Yemen: Power Struggle Continues After Saleh Departure." BBC News. http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-middle-east-13842014

 <sup>53 &</sup>quot;Guide: Syria Crisis." BBC News. June 23, 2011. http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-middle-east-13855203
 54 Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> "Patrick Cockburn: Hope Fades as Democracy Fades as Civil Wars Grip Region." The Independent. http://www.independent.co.uk/opinion/commentators/patrick-cockburn-hopes-for-democracy-fade-as-civil-wars-grip-the-arabworld-2296452.html

from their command.<sup>56</sup> The Arab Spring reached one of its worst moments with the ongoing civil conflict in Libya. The conflict between the Oaddafi-led government and rebel forces under an interim council began to escalate soon after demonstration turned violent.<sup>57</sup> Not only has this war torn the country in two politically-speaking but it also has led to numerous external bombing campaigns and a harsh stalemate that continues to boil over causing a high loss of life and long-term damage to their infrastructure and economic networks. The Libyan crisis give a clear answer to how dangerous the situation can become in the region, as well as raising additional concerns over whether it will spread elsewhere before it's over. The Egyptian first undersecretary of foreign affairs Ahmed Fathalla highlighted this on his recent visit to Turkey, stating, "Any instability in Syria will affect all the neighboring countries in the region. Therefore all the countries in the region should cooperate to resolve these issues. Any foreign intervention would lead to further instability and this would have negative effects on the region,"58 Similar events have occurred in Yemen as opposition forces and tribal disputes have shattered the country's unity. 59 Although conditions are less dangerous in Syria, there remains news of defections and deadly street battles that are ominously familiar to those in beginning stages of the civil conflicts in Yemen and Libya. 60 As one of the chief goals of the UNSC, maintaining "international peace and security in accordance with the principles and purposes of the United Nations" directly includes the potential destabilizing effect that civil war has on the region. The Arab spring has already spread to every corner of the region and has even had widespread influence on other political movements. As a result, the UNSC must evaluate ways to alleviate the security situation in regards to region's two active internal conflicts to keep them from spreading elsewhere.

## Humanitarian Concerns and Security

The humanitarian aspect of the recent political change cannot be ignored by this committee either. The most severe concern and the one which is most germane remains the violent crackdown against protesters in some Middle Eastern states. This is a major concern for four reasons. First, crackdowns in Libya and Yemen have led to outright civil war as highlighted before. These protests started much more peacefully, but the government response led to dangerously escalating street violence. 62 The use of government troops against protesters led some army units to defect in Libya and armed groups began operating against government units after a heavy-handed government response. Second, humanitarian concerns include minority violence, an increase in refugees fleeing the area as well as heightened tensions with neighbors. In Syria, Kurdish refugees fled the uprising creating a tedious situation on the border with Turkey. 63 Likewise, similar ethnic groups cross state borders, thus creating refugee and border concerns. Third, there is a considerable risk of children becoming involved in this conflict. According to some estimates. fifteen to twenty percent of soldiers for opposition groups in Yemen are children. 64 Two of these groups have since been added to the UN's list of offenders. Fourth and finally, concerns over treatment of protesters have led to calls for action to protect those involved. The High Commissioner for Human Rights Navi Pillay stated, "Several governments reacted in a violent and repressive fashion, leading to the loss of thousands of lives, torture, arbitrary detention, disappearances and other violations."<sup>65</sup> In response to news that gunships and other heavy weapons were used against Libyan protesters, NATO began a bombing campaign against military targets. <sup>66</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> "Over 100 Libyan army defect from Qaddafi." Reuters. http://www.reuters.com/article/2011/05/30/us-libya-officersidUSTRE74T41820110530

Deepa Babington. "Libya: The Story So Far." BBC News. May 30, 2011. http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-13860458 58 "Egypt, Turkey agree on Syria, a number of issues." Terrorism Watch. June 24, 2011.

http://www.terrorismwatch.org/2011/06/egypt-turkey-agree-on-syria-number-of.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Jeb Boone. "Who is running Yemen." Foreign Policy. July 11, 2011. http://mideast.foreignpolicy.com/posts/2011/07/11/who\_is\_running\_yemen

<sup>60 &</sup>quot;Syria: Investigating Jisr al-Shughour." BBC News. June 22, 2011.

http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-middle-east-13857654

<sup>61 &</sup>quot;Functions and Powers." United Nations Security Council.

http://www.un.org/Docs/sc/unsc functions.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Jeremy Bowen. "Libya: The Story So Far." BBC News. August 16, 2011. http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-13860458 63 Jonathan Head. "Turkey's Dilemma over Syrian Unrest." BBC News. June 11, 2011. http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/worldeurope-13737946

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> "Yemen: Conflict Generating More Child Soldiers." IRIN news. July 20, 2011.

http://www.irinnews.org/report.aspx?reportid=93281

<sup>65 &</sup>quot;Arab Spring Shows that Human Rights are Everywhere, for Everyone." UN News Centre. http://www.un.org/apps/news/story.asp?NewsID=38898&Cr=north+africa&Cr1=

<sup>66 &</sup>quot;Libya: The Story So Far." BBC News.

## Terrorism/Non-state Actors and Instability

The third and final facet of this topic is the issue of terrorism and the trafficking of drugs and arms across borders destabilized by the ongoing protests. The Arab Spring's goal of democratic advancement came at an extraordinary cost of stability in most countries it affected. In cases where civil conflict remains, this situation continues to exist. As a result, the potential growth and influence of non-state actors threatens the entire region. On the first issue of terrorism, the ongoing instability in Yemen has brought fears that extremists such as the Yemen-based Al Qaeda in the Arabian Peninsula (AOAP) would take advantage of the situation. Yemen conducted a major offensive against the group in 2010, but the protests throughout Yemen have curtailed any further assaults on AQAP holdouts. 67 Yemeni ambassador to the United Kingdom declared, "Al-Qaeda, they take advantage of the recent situation in Yemen, and of course I cannot say that we are facing an easy enemy. They are becoming stronger and stronger, especially after the crisis we are facing in Yemen. Yemenis are bleeding every day in Shabwa and Abyan fighting al-Qaeda." If the international community closes its eyes then they will get stronger and stronger." Additionally, as these groups are fighting against government forces they may be seen by the general population as "liberators" thus driving political opinion on their side. This is true in several cases where leaders blamed the legitimate protests as work of foreign terrorists. <sup>69</sup> Nevertheless, even in the Libyan case, there are real concerns that these uprisings have terrorist links within their core. The main concern for the UNSC on this issue is the proper avenue of action. Actions that could be perceived as interference in internal affairs could fan the flames of dissent in the region, which work against many goals of the international community.

The second aspect that the UNSC needs to address is the renewed risk of illegal activities by non-state actors in the region. With large protests and civil strife in several states, the potential gains by these groups are unprecedented. First, the risk of ethnic conflict is increased by these groups, many of whom are minorities attempting greater influence with the loss of central authority. In Yemen, Zaydi Muslims make up a large majority of the northern opposition forces. They have a conducted a slow civil war for years, but have been considerably more active since Yemen had its first protests. These fighters have been known to cross the Yemeni-Saudi border and remain an issue of bilateral concern. Additionally, the recent situation in Syria also invokes concerns over non-state actors gaining ground. With the weakened central authority, basic security is often lacking, creating opportunities for arms traffickers to feed weapons that aid the escalating conflicts. Additional groups such as drug smugglers and human traffickers can operate more easily in the chaos. This results in two implications. The first is that regional ties are damaged as one weak border creates security concerns for all of their neighbors. Additionally, non-state actors can operate with impunity with weak borders which help to lengthen the conflict.

#### Previous UN Action on the Issue

The UN has responded to the crisis in the Middle East with two defining motions. The first is Resolution 1994, which address a UN observer force in the Golan Heights. <sup>70</sup> It noted that, "with concern that the situation in the Middle East is tense and is likely to remain so…" This reference deals less with the situation as it does with the continuing UNSC presence in the Israel-Palestine question. The UNSC also released a series of resolutions on the simmering security concerns of Somalia and Sudan, which were relatively unaffected by the Arab Spring. <sup>7172</sup> Nevertheless, their instability is a factor in the ongoing crisis in the region.

The second series of germane resolutions surround the UNSC response to the Libyan civil war. The first was Resolution 1970 (2011). It stated," *Deploring* the gross and systematic violation of human rights, including the

http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-13860458

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> Jeremy Bowen. "Yemen: Security and the Collapsing State." BBC News. August 16, 2011. http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-middle-east-11482963

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Frank Gardner. "Is the Arab Spring Good or Bad for Terrorism." BBC News. June 22, 2011. http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-middle-east-13878774

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> "Libya: Rebels and NATO dismiss Qaddafi ceasefire offer. BBC News. April 30, 2011. http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-13249923

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> S/RES/1994 (2011). United Nations Security Council. June 30, 2011. http://www.un.org/ga/search/view\_doc.asp?symbol=S/RES/1994(2011)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup>S/RES/1978 (2011). United Nations Security Council. April 27, 2011.

http://www.un.org/Docs/journal/asp/ws.asp?m=S/RES/1978%20(2011)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> S/RES/1976 (2011). United Nations Security Council. April 11, 2011. http://www.un.org/ga/search/view\_doc.asp?symbol=S/RES/1976(2011)

repression of peaceful demonstrators, expressing deep concern at the deaths of civilians, and rejecting unequivocally the incitement to hostility and violence against the civilian population made from the highest level of the Libyan government."<sup>73</sup> The document demanded action by the Libyan government to protect civilians and foreign nationals. In addition to these demands, the UNSC recommended the International Criminal Court to investigate potential criminal charges. After Resolution 1970 was largely unheeded, the UNSC passed Resolution 1973 (2011) which created a no-fly zone to protect protesters and opposition forces from air raids. It also enforced an arms embargo, a ban on flights for government officials, a freeze on overseas assets and the creation of a panel of experts to look into the situation further. 74 This document serves as the most comprehensive action taken by the committee thus far.

#### Committee Directive

There are many aspects that this committee is tasked with addressing. Nevertheless, they fall under three main directives. First, the entire of issue of the Arab Spring must be addressed. At the moment, only Libya and most recently Syria has received attention from the UNSC. As a result, the situation throughout the Middle East has gone on without a UN mandate. Resolution 1970 and 1973 work in tandem to show how the UNSC can address the issue, however, this document does not properly address the far reaching and long term aspects of the Arab Spring.

Second, the UNSC must decide how best to prevent another civil war from happening. Libya's slow destructive conflict has set the country back decades internally. The possibility of two more long term civil wars will have a terrible influence on the political stability of the region. Delegates must work on evaluating the potential use of "hard" responses such as sanctions, arms embargoes and peacekeeping forces as well as 'soft" power alternatives such as security meetings, ceasefire talks, and power brokering agreements. Resolution 1973 provides an excellent framework for delegates on this issue.

Third and finally, the UNSC must respect the issue of sovereignty in regards to the Arab Spring. Many Arab governments have been able to peacefully solve their citizens' concerns through legitimate means such as economic opportunities, political changes and better access to basic needs. Those states have resisted the demands placed by protesters remain the legitimate authority unless documented abuses can be found. Even in these cases, the UNSC must not rush to judgment. The UN has trusted the Security Council with the responsibility of upholding peace and hasty actions will only exacerbate the situation.

## III: Examining the Practicality and Effectiveness of Sanctions

"...just as we recognize the importance of sanctions as a way of compelling compliance with the will of the international community, we also recognize that sanctions remain a blunt instrument, which hurt large numbers of people who are not their primary targets. Further, sanctions need refining if they are to be seen as more than a fig leaf in the future." –former UN Secretary-General Kofi Annan<sup>75</sup>

#### Introduction

The use of sanctions as a tool of political action has been a major element of United Nations policy since the body's inception in 1945. As a whole, the international community has looked at the idea of sanctions as an effective tool that is more deliberate than diplomatic speech but less harmful than outright conflict. Sanctions in this role thus serve a valuable asset for use in stemming conflicts before they escalate. Many supporters look to the success of sanctions against apartheid in South Africa as a prime case of encouraging a peaceful and positive outcome to a humanitarian problem. <sup>76</sup> Nevertheless, some scholars are quick to point out that sanctions were just one of the steps

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> S/RES/1970 (2011). United Nations Security Council. February 26, 2011. http://www.un.org/Docs/journal/asp/ws.asp?m=S/RES/1970%20(2011)

S/RES/1973 (2011). United Nations Security Council, March 17, 2011.

http://daccess-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N11/268/39/PDF/N1126839.pdf?OpenElement

<sup>75 &</sup>quot;Secretary-General Reviews Lessons Learned During "Sanctions Decade" in Remarks to International Peace Academy Seminar. UN Security Council. http://www.un.org/Docs/sc/committees/sanctions/sgstatement.htm <sup>76</sup> "Impact of Economic and Political Sanctions on Apartheid." The African File. June 7, 2007.

that led to the fall of the racial division. Sanctions have been heavily used in the last few decades but their use dates back to the creation of the League of Nations following the First World War. The Since that time, there have been roughly one hundred and twenty cases where sanctions were implemented. Research has shown that sanctions at least partially succeeded a third of the time. In some of these cases, the explicit threat of war loomed on the horizon. Nevertheless, recent studies have cast doubt on the effectiveness of sanctions to accomplish their designed goals. Most importantly, some argue that sanctions have a negative effect on the entire situation. As a result, the United Nations (UN), regional bodies, and Member State governments have had to reevaluate their predominate reliance on sanctions. This has been accomplished through a variety of ways which will be discussed later in the guide. The major dilemma for this committee is threefold: first, how can the international community make sanctions effective without causing undue humanitarian tragedy? Second, how can international cooperation enhance the effectiveness of sanctions? Third and finally, can sanctions be practical in the international system?

## **Definition of Sanctions**

Sanctions can take many forms and a brief discussion is required to better understand the different elements. There are two main types of sanctions: economic and non-economic. The use of these sanctions can vary by the purpose for which they are intended. Economic sanction can include limiting exports and imports from the target country as well as restricting investments. These limitations can include whole industries or select products. Economic sanctions can also include the prohibition of private financial transactions to the target country. Finally, this form of sanctions can limit the amount of assistance the target country receives from organizations and government programs. Economic sanctions represent the most well-known form of sanctions that leveled by individual governments and the international community.<sup>80</sup>

Non-economic sanctions can be defined as actions as," sanctions against a target country to persuade its government to change policy. In contrast to economic sanctions, which are intended to penalize a target country financially, non-economic sanctions are aimed at denying legitimacy or prestige." These can be considered "soft" sanctions as their damage is reflected in the way that the target state is seen and perceived in the international system. These sanctions are often carried out by individual states as well as some organizations. Non-economic actions include denying visas to target country's officials, recalling ambassadors and restricting foreign aid. Additionally, a target state can be blocked from joining international and regional organizations and from receiving aid and loans from these bodies.

One type of sanctions cannot be easily categorized and that is arms embargoes. Although military aid can be economic, this type of sanctions deals with restricting the target country from starting, prolonging or increasing conflict. Arms embargoes can be levied against all states in a conflict, against states in civil conflict, as well as one side of a conflict such as Iraq in the 1991 war in the Persian Gulf.

#### Effectiveness of Sanctions

The first concern for this committee is the issue of effectiveness. Can sanctions of any type actually create change? The main debate around this is twofold, can sanctions be both humane and effective and can sanctions be actually implemented in the manner they are designed? In regards to the first question, the main answer that has been given is in regard to targeted sanctions. Targeted sanctions can be economic or non-economic and can take many forms such as travel restrictions, diplomatic restraints, and seizing assets of specific individuals. <sup>83</sup> These sanctions are not comprehensive, but are designed to hurt those in power and make political changes. Even in states with fragile economies, these sanctions theoretically have little to no effect on the civilian population. Additionally, targeted

http://theafricanfile.com/academics/ucsd-2/impact-of-economic-and-political-sanctions-on-apartheid/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> Kimberly Ann Elliot, et al. "Sanctions." Concise Encyclopedia of Economics.

http://www.econlib.org/library/Enc/Sanctions.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> Ibid.

<sup>79</sup> Ibid

<sup>80</sup> Robert O'Quinn. "A User's Guide to Economic Sanctions." The Heritage Foundation. June 25, 1997. http://www.heritage.org/research/reports/1997/06/a-users-guide-to-economic-sanctions

<sup>81</sup> Ibid.

<sup>82</sup> Ibid

<sup>83 &</sup>quot;Smart Sanctions." Federal Department of Economic Affairs. http://www.seco.admin.ch/themen/00513/00620/00639/index.html?lang=en

sanctions can be used so that exports are still able to fund infrastructure projects and not military or defense spending. To answer the second question, the main achievement thus far is to make reasonable goals. A 1992 report by an American office reported that, "The prevailing belief in the academic and business communities that sanctions are generally "ineffective" has been reached by comparing the results of sanctions against their publicly revealed primary goal." This is not to say that the goal cannot be effective, it just must be modest in scope.

## The Practicality of Sanctions

The second issue is the problem of practicality. Sanctions must be appropriate but also must not be too damaging or taxing to other Member States as well. They must also serve an attainable purpose. With increasing economic interdependence in the world today, sanctions may be too costly to maintain. Additionally, sanctions cannot be indefinite thus some method of monitoring is necessary. Former UN Secretary-General Kofi Annan stated both of these points: "in other cases, little if any effort has gone into setting up regimes to monitor or enforce sanctions, which have therefore proved ineffective as a result of widespread violations. And in some cases, neighboring countries that bear much of the economic and trading loss from compliance have not been compensated by the rest of the international community and, as a result, have allowed sanctions to become porous." Sanctions that lack proper monitoring and assistance are much more likely to fail and be longer than those that succeed. At the same time, the previously discussed damage to the civilian population may have polarized them in favor of the government that the sanctions were designed to influence.

## The Need for Multilateral International Sanctions

One of the premier points surrounding sanctions today is the issue of multi-lateral and unilateral sanctions. Unilateral sanctions are widely condemned in the international community despite their widespread use. On the other hand, multilateral sanctions do suffer from the fact that they can appear to be too vague, with many divergent opinions. Sanctions are designed to be sent with a clear, decisive message, thus multi-lateral resolutions may suffer from a clear cut goal, making their success harder to gauge. At the same time, these sanctions carry more clout in the international system. The more voices behind a sanctions resolution, the more likely it will be enforced. At the same time, the potential damage the Member States would suffer as a result of implementing these sanctions would be minimized. One agency stated it this way, "As nations in the international system become more interdependent and the volume of world trade and financial transactions increases, it is increasingly difficult to completely isolate a target nation from supplies of imports, markets for exports, and financial inflows." Multilateral sanctions help to alleviate some of this pressure. Nevertheless, the goal for this committee is to find ways to make UNSC resolutions more direct and targeted with the power behind a multilateral document.

#### Previous UN Action concerning Sanctions

The Security Council has been very active in regards to sanctions. Their activity can be categorized into three sections: resolutions, the Working Group on Sanctions, and the Stockholm Process. Resolutions declaring economic sanctions have been in existence since the League of Nations, but it was not until twenty years ago that sanctions were more heavily used by the UN. This is especially true for the UNSC. Resolution 751 ushered in sanctions due to the security breakdown in Somalia. This is especially true for the UNSC also began creating sanction against Saddam Hussein in Iraq and Slobodan Milosevic in Yugoslavia. The UNSC also began creating sanctions committees to oversee the implementation and evaluation of the committee's efforts. These have been created for every set of sanctions that have been passed since the turn of the millennium. At the same time, the UNSC attempted to address early concerns against sanctions. As the UNSC has stated, "relevant Security Council decisions have reflected a more refined approach to the design, application and implementation of mandatory sanctions. These refinements have included measures targeted at specific actors, as well as humanitarian exceptions embodied in Security Council

<sup>84 &</sup>quot;Economic Sanctions: Effectiveness as Tools of Foreign Policy." United States General Accounting Office. February 1992. http://archive.gao.gov/t2pbat6/146166.pdf

<sup>85</sup> Secretary-General Reviews Lessons Learned During "Sanctions Decade" in Remarks to International Peace Academy Seminar. UN Security Council. http://www.un.org/Docs/sc/committees/sanctions/sgstatement.htm
86 Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> "Security Council Committee Pursuant to Resolutions 751 (1992) and 1907 (2009) concerning Somalia and Eritrea." United Nations Security Council. http://www.un.org/sc/committees/751/

<sup>884</sup> History Lessons." The Economist. October 19, 2006. http://www.economist.com/node/8058039

resolutions. Targeted sanctions, for instance, can involve the freezing of assets and blocking the financial transactions of political elites or entities whose behaviour triggered sanctions in the first place." One of the key documents that resulted from this move was Resolution1730, which ensured that there were clear procedures for placing and removing states, entities and individuals from sanctions lists. 90

A further effort by the Security Council was the informal Working Group on General Issues Sanctions. Created in 2000, it issued a report to the UNSC in regards to their findings. Its purpose was, "The task of the Working Group is to develop general recommendations on how to improve the effectiveness of United Nations sanctions." This was a major step in improving the way sanctions worked. Among the areas that the group addressed, they highlighted the use of targeted sanctions, as well as sanctions against parties that violated arms embargoes and other previous sanctions. The report also stressed the necessity of communication between the UNSC, sanction committees and other monitoring bodies.

The Stockholm Process was completed in 2006 and was one of the steps towards successful targeted sanctions and falls under the work of the Working Group, Nevertheless, it should be highlighted for several things. A Swedish initiative with the Uppsala University, the purpose "...is to strengthen the implementation of targeted sanctions and it is planned to present a report to the UN Security Council in the form of a handbook primarily for practical use in UN work." Most importantly, it took previous studies from sanctions to improve the effectiveness of new efforts. Finally, the Stockholm Process did produce a very helpful report that should be studied before the addressing the issue of UN sanctions. Known as *Making Targeted Sanctions Effective*, it was the main result of the Stockholm Process 93

#### Case Study: Libya

To put all of the pieces elaborated on above in context, the case study of Libyan sanctions in 2011 will be addressed next. The recent events surrounding the Arab Spring in Libya serves as a useful background to the issue of multi-lateral sanctions as well as the success of targeted sanctions. In early 2011, protests against the regime of Muammar Al-Qaddafi erupted in cities throughout the North African country of Libya. Immediately, the government opposed these protests and soon resorted to firing on civilians and carrying out humanitarian crimes. Repeated calls for an end to human rights abuses went unheeded and the UNSC stepped in to address the issue. The first action came with UNSC resolution 1970 (2011) which condemned the actions by the Libyan government. It also set into action the demands needed to be met in the crisis. In response to the lack of action on the part of Qaddafi's government, the UNSC passed UN Resolution 1973 which serves as a prime example of sanctions writing. It authorized a no-fly zone for all aircraft as well as a strict embargo in arms. Both of these sanctions are considered to be "tough" and reflect the strong views of the UNSC on the issue. At the same time, the resolution included several targeted sanctions. These included a ban on flights for targeted personnel and an asset freeze. The document included several monetary institutions as well as select individuals. Resolution 1973 also created a panel of experts to look into the issue further.

http://daccess-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N11/245/58/PDF/N1124558.pdf?OpenElement

http://daccess-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N11/268/39/PDF/N1126839.pdf? OpenElement with the property of the

-

96 Ibid.

<sup>89 &</sup>quot;UN Security Council Sanctions Committee: An Overview." United Nations Security Council. http://www.un.org/sc/committees/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> "Focal Point for Delisting Established Pursuant to Security Council Resolution 1730 (2006)." United Nations Security Council. http://www.un.org/sc/committees/dfp.shtml

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> "Informal Security Council Working Group on General Issues on Sanctions." United Nations. http://www.un.org/Docs/sc/committees/sanctions/index.html

<sup>92 &</sup>quot;The Stockholm Process-a Swedish Initiative for More Effective Sanctions. Uppsala University. http://www.smartsanctions.se/

Peter Wallensteen, et al. "Making Targeted Sanctions Effective." Uppsala University. 2003. http://www.smartsanctions.se/stockholm\_process/reports/Final%20report%20complete.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> S/RES/1970 (2011). United Nations Security Council. February 26, 2011.

<sup>95</sup> S/RES/1973 (2011). United Nations Security Council. March 17, 2011.

#### Committee Directive

The directive for this committee is four-fold. First, delegates must evaluate current sanctions under the specific guise of practicality and effectiveness. Are these going to be long-term sanctions and if so can they be maintained? Should some sanctions committees be changed or disbanded? Delegates of the UNSC have to ability to make these changes if they are necessary. Thirdly, delegates must look to the humanitarian side of the committee mandates. What are the best ways to protect the civilian population? How can targeted sanctions be improved or is there even a solid example that future sessions can follow?

Second, delegates need to examine the work of the Working Group on General Issues in Sanctions and decide what changes need to be addressed. Were there recommendations that have not been fully implemented but should be? Did some changes occur but not in a satisfactory manner? What can be improved? Delegates have the advantage of a large body of recent work that has not been fully evaluated as well as having more cases to evaluate from. Additionally, delegates are highly encouraged to look into the Stockholm Process and its work towards targeted sanctions as both a model and foundation for some of their work.

Fourth and finally, this committee must consider the very nature of sanctions. What is their purpose in the UN system? Are they truly necessary? If so, it what ways? Is there a suitable alternative? This is not to say that sanctions are not suitable. The purpose of this topic is to evaluate not condemn sanctions. This question is important for it gets to the very point of the topic of practicality and effectiveness.

# IV: Climate Change and International Security

#### Introduction

Former Secretary General Kofi Annan and his High Level Panel on Threats, Challenges, and Change defined international peace and security threats in 2003 as "any event or process that leads to large-scale death or lessening of life chances and undermines States as the basic unit of the international system." The panel then identified six main areas as threats: interstate conflict; internal conflict; terrorism; nuclear, chemical, and biological weapons; transnational organized crime; and economic and social threats including disease, extreme poverty and *environmental degradation*. Therefore, climate change will be one of the more problematic threats our generation will face, a threat that is not only environmental, but also political, economic and social. Thus, the UNSC must assess the threat to international security on all levels to prevent any significant impact on global peace and it must do so with a sense of urgency.

With the upsurge in threats to global peace from non-state actors, it is imperative that the UNSC returns to its roots of multilateral cooperation present at its inception in order "to save succeeding generations from the scourges of war." Kofi Annan stated that the UN is not at liberty to divide its resources between hard and soft threats, that it must not choose between traditional militarized threats, such as WMDs, and soft threats, such as climate change or economic upheaval simply because in today's globalized world, the interconnectedness leads to "catastrophic consequences" from either source. Climate change is a non-state actor, and is defined as "a change of climate which is attributed directly or indirectly to human activity that alters the composition of the global atmosphere and which is in addition to natural climate variability observed over comparable time periods. Climate change in one Member State may be the result of actions from another Member State, and thus it requires full multilateral cooperation in order to solve the problem of continued climate change. However, that is a matter for the General

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> Sonia Gupta. "Environmental Law and Policy: Climate Change as a Threat to International Peace and Security." *Perspectives on Global Issues*. Fall 2009. <a href="http://www.perspectivesonglobalissues.com/0401/envirolaw.pdf">http://www.perspectivesonglobalissues.com/0401/envirolaw.pdf</a>
<sup>98</sup> Thid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> Charter of the United Nations. United Nations General Assembly. June 1945. http://www.un.org/en/documents/charter/preamble.shtml

http://www.un.org/en/documents/charter/preamble.shtml
100 Annan, Kofi, *In Larger Freedom: towards development, security and human rights for all,* Ch. 3 Art. 78, Report of the Secretary General, http://www.un.org/largerfreedom/chap3.htm

United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, Art. 1(2) http://unfccc.int/resource/docs/convkp/conveng.pdf

Assembly. The UNSC must concern itself therefore with the impact that climate change has on peace and security, not only as a threat multiplier, but as a threat itself.

Under the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC), it is widely accepted that climate change is a reality by the members of this body. Furthermore, members have agreed that the overall warming of global temperatures will produce lasting adverse effects. The UNFCCC defines adverse effects as "changes in the physical environment or biota resulting from climate change which have significant deleterious effects on the composition, resilience or productivity of natural and managed ecosystems or on the operation of socio-economic systems or on human health and welfare." Clearly, climate change results in political, economic and social instability, all of which either leads to conflict or exacerbates existing conflict. It is up to the UNSC to mitigate those conflicts that may arise, and the best way to do so is to have a proactive plan in place in case of contingencies resulting from climate change.

While not all agree that climate change poses a threat itself to international peace and security, it is widely accepted to be a threat multiplier, particularly in already vulnerable States. In July of 2011, the President of the Security Council released a statement which acknowledged this belief, stating "climate change may ... aggravate certain existing threats to international peace and security." And, during the meeting held on 20 July 2011, Secretary General Ban Ki-Moon concurred that climate change exacerbates existing threats and warns that climate change is accelerating in a dangerous manner which could result in an "unholy brew" that will create "dangerous security vacuums."104

Political instability occurs from the increase in competition over shared resources as those resources become more scarce. As the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change states in its report in 2007, climate change results in environmental degradation consisting of the following: increasing infectious disease vectors, mass migration, glacial melting, extreme weather occurrences, salination of the water supply, and an increase in floods and droughts. <sup>1</sup> surprisingly, these effects are exponentially more adverse for already fragile situations, thus creating even more political instability. 106 In Secretary General Ban Ki-Moon's speech before the UNSC in 2007 he agreed with the above assessment and concluded that it was "especially true in vulnerable regions that face multiple stresses at the same time—preexisting conflict, poverty and unequal access to resources, weak institutions, food insecurity and the incidence of diseases such as HIV/AIDS."107

## Impacts of Climate Change on Security

Resources such as water and arable land are becoming compromised as climate change creates desertification and reduces glaciers and underground aquifers. A decrease in rainfall due to climate change directly inhibits a region's ability to water crops and provide adequate drinking water to its citizens. The result is lower agricultural yields which lead to food shortages. When the drought is sustained, famine occurs and migration across state borders is imminent. The need to locate and utilize more water sources to mitigate this reality has already caused problems between States regarding the use of transboundary rivers and aguifers. Secretary General Ban Ki-Moon stated recently that "competition between communities and countries for scarce resources—especially water—was increasing... exacerbating old security dilemmas and creating new ones, while environmental refugees were "reshaping the human geography" of the planet, a trend that would only increase as deserts advanced, forests were felled, and sea-levels rose."10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, Art. 1(1) <a href="http://unfccc.int/resource/docs/convkp/conveng.pdf">http://unfccc.int/resource/docs/convkp/conveng.pdf</a> <sup>103</sup> "Statement by the President of the Security Council." United Nations Security Council. July 22, 2011. http://www.un.org/Docs/sc/unsc\_pres\_statements11.htm

104
Security Council 6587<sup>th</sup> Meeting, 20 July 2011, SC/10332

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> Climate Change 2007: Synthesis Report. Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. 2007. P30. http://www.ipcc.ch/pdf/assessment-report/ar4/syr/ar4\_syr.pdf

106
National Security and the Threat of Climate Change. US Center for Naval Analysis—CNA Corporation. 2007.

http://securityandclimate.cna.org/report/National%20Security%20and%20the%20Threat%20of%20Climate%20Change.pdf

107 Security Council Debate on Climate Change as a Threat to International Peace and Security, Security Council 5663<sup>rd</sup> meeting,

<sup>17</sup> April 2007. http://www.un.org/News/Press/docs/2007/sc9000.doc.htm 108 Security Council 6587th Meeting, 20 July 2011, SC/10332

Not only has desertification had an impact on international peace and security, it has played a large role economically as well. Lower yields mean higher prices and for a State already in crisis, higher costs for food are devastating. The same holds true for regions experiencing heavier than normal rainfall and flooding. (Flooding can not only ruin crops, but they can cause drinking water supplies to become unfit for consumption.) According to reports, "global food prices have spiked since the year 2000, mostly since 2006, with some key crops doubling." <sup>109</sup> Secretary General Ban Ki-moon gave the following warning about people in the poorest nations; "They have no buffer. When prices go up, they go hungry. Women and children are the worst hit." Furthermore, populations in post-conflict regions or those suffering from instability very rarely can afford an increase in global food prices following drought or similar event; couple that with the inability to access substitute goods and they become even more vulnerable to the impacts of climate change. 111

The food crisis in the Horn of Africa is a prime example of the economic impact climate change has created in the region. Threats to water management, animal health, and crop production have left the region with severe food insecurity. The cost to take the necessary action to absorb and minimize the effects of climate change in Nigeria alone is estimated to be \$3 billion. And the cost is not limited to the Horn of Africa, but has already impacted the international community as well. Achim Steiner, Executive Director of the United Nations Environment Program (UNEP) stated that as many as ten UNSC mandated peacekeeping operations, costing \$35 billion, which is half of the peacekeeping budget, had been sent to States where resources played a key role in conflict, such as Darfur, the Central African Republic, and Northern Kenya and Chad. He further warns that the quantity and quality of resources are at increasing risk from climate change and "broad, cooperative action was needed to prevent irreversible tipping points, leading to sudden, abrupt shocks to communities." <sup>112</sup>

Lack of rainfall isn't the only issue. Climate change increases severe or extreme weather occurrences, such as floods, hurricanes, tornados and typhoons resulting in devastation to infrastructure, clean water supplies, crops and disease control. Storm surges around low lying coastal areas due to extreme weather have a disastrous effect on port systems and energy production/distribution causing spikes in prices of both petroleum products and shipping. And the occurrence of these storms will begin to manifest in areas not normally affected by such. 113 The economic impact, especially in major port cities, can be astronomical, and due to increased global trade and a scarcity of commodities such as petroleum products, the impact will be felt worldwide.

And then there is the threat of loss of geography due to rising sea levels. Marcus Stephen, the president of Nauru, speaking on behalf of the Pacific small island developing States, predicts the very survival of Member States are at risk from climate change due to rising sea levels. 114 While sea level increase can decimate low lying port cities around the world, it can obliterate entire island States. In turn, people will be forced to relocate, first internally and then across State borders. The environmental refugees will present a new strain on the international community. Echoing Stephen's sentiments, Richard Marles, Australia's Parliamentary Secretary for Pacific Island Affairs, stated that the sea, which had been in the past a source of food, security and cultural prominence has become a source of threat and anxiety. 115 Sea-level rise is estimated to reach one meter by the end of the century, increasing the occurrence of storm surges, coastal inundation, erosion, and territorial degradation and loss, all of which create uninhabitable environments for low lying areas. 116 It is a very real threat, and many of these States have already begun to feel the adverse effects of sea-level rise.

What can be done to prevent a situation where UN Member States cease to exist geographically? Solomon Islanders have already begun migrating to Papua New Guinea, with an expected complete submersion of the islands by

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> Robert Roy Britt. "Global Food Shortage Becomes Urgent as Planet Warms" Live Science. June 5, 2011. http://www.livescience.com/14447-global-food-shortage-urgent-climate-global-warming.html lbid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> Security Council 6587<sup>th</sup> Meeting, 20 July 2011, SC/10332

 $<sup>^{112}</sup>$  Security Council 6587th Meeting , 20 July 2011, SC/10332

<sup>113</sup> Climate Change 2007: Synthesis Report. Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. 2007. http://www.ipcc.ch/pdf/assessment-report/ar4/syr/ar4\_syr.pdf

Security Council 6587<sup>th</sup> Meeting, 20 July 2011, SC/10332

<sup>115</sup> Ibid.

<sup>116</sup> Ibid.

2015.<sup>117</sup> It is further estimated that 150-200 million refugees will be displaced by the year 2050.<sup>118</sup> In Bangladesh, even a 45 centimeter rise in sea level will force its 5.5 million people living in its coastal regions to relocate. In the past, a similar forced migration had been the cause of violent conflict.<sup>119</sup> Future predictions of violence state that in this decade we will see an increase border skirmishes and conflict in Bangladesh, India and China due to such relocation.<sup>120</sup> Clearly, migrations will lead to conflict without the proper proactive steps taken to mitigate the threat they pose.

#### Case Studies

Northeastern Africa

It has been reported that the desertification of Northern Sudan resulted in a mass migration into Southern Sudan which in turn contributed to the violence in Darfur. Rainfall in the region had decreased by 30%, leaving millions of acres of land dry and barren. The example of the Darfur conflict clearly exhibits the ability of water scarcity to act as a catalyst for civil unrest. In 2005 former UN Secretary General Boutros Boutros-Ghali warned that water wars between States surrounding the Nile basin are inevitable. The summer of the property of the pro

Libya, Egypt, Sudan and Chad all share the Nubian Aquifer system, one of the largest in the world. Most recent research indicates that the aquifer is non-renewable. Libya currently withdraws water from the underground reservoir in the southern desert and pumps it through an extensive pipeline system hundreds of miles north near the Mediterranean coast for agricultural irrigation. Such a massive drawdown of the non-renewable water reserves of the Nubian Aquifer has brought Libya into conflict with the other riparian states that share it, especially considering that estimates say the water will run out in 40-60 years depending on rate of withdrawal. This doesn't bode well for the newly created farmland or the stability of the region, which is currently causing discord between Libya and Egypt. As rainfall continues to decrease, Sudan and Egypt will need to begin tapping the aquifer as well; however, being a non-renewable aquifer, it will not be enough to sustain farming and drinking water in the region.

## The Maldives, Solomon Islands and other island States

As mentioned previously, the Solomon Islands are under threat of losing their geography to sea-level rise. But they are not the only States in peril. The Marshall Islands are also facing the loss of 80% of the Majuro Atoll, which is its capital due to erosion and coastal inundation. <sup>125</sup> The Maldives have been proactive in fighting this threat, as many of their islands are less than a meter above sea level. With the help of the Japanese they have constructed a three meter high wall around the capital island of Male to help protect it from storm surges, which have been occurring every two weeks for some time now. Traditional ways of life have already been lost due to the changing tides and weather patterns. The government has implemented ambitious beach and reef clean-up programs, as well as reforestation programs to help curb the degradation of their islands. They have also instituted awareness programs in their schools to promote environmentally sound practices in communities across the islands. In Kandholhudhoo, found in the

<sup>117 &</sup>quot;Climate Change refugees to be resettled in PNG." Australia Broadcasting Corporation. November 5, 2008. http://www.abc.net.au/news/stories/2008/11/05/2411248.htm

<sup>118</sup> Nicholas Stern. "Stern Review Report on the Economics of Climate Change." Policy Innovations. Fall 2006.

http://www.policyinnovations.org/ideas/policy\_library/data/01379

Sonia Gupta. "Environmental Law and Policy: Climate Change as a Threat to International Peace and Security." *Perspectives* 

Sonia Gupta. "Environmental Law and Policy: Climate Change as a Threat to International Peace and Security." *Perspectives on Global Issues*. Fall 2009. <a href="http://www.perspectivesonglobalissues.com/0401/envirolaw.pdf">http://www.perspectivesonglobalissues.com/0401/envirolaw.pdf</a>
120 Ibid.

<sup>121</sup> Sudan: Post-Conflict Environmental Assessment. United Nation Environment Program. June 2007. p. 9. http://postconflict.unep.ch/publications/UNEP\_Sudan.pdf

http://postconflict.unep.ch/publications/UNEP\_Sudan.pdf

122 Climate Change and Foreign Policy: An exploration of options for greater integration. International Institute for Sustainable Development. 2007. http://www.iisd.org/pdf/2007/climate\_foreign\_policy.pdf

Ashok Swain, *Managing water Conflict Asia, Africa and the Middle East* (London and New York: Routledge), 2004 lbid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>125</sup> Security Council 6587<sup>th</sup> Meeting, 20 July 2011, SC/10332

north of the island chain and densely-populated has agree to voluntarily evacuate 60% of the residents over the next 15 years. Those left behind undoubtedly will be forced to follow suit. 126

According Marcus Stephen, speaking on behalf of the Pacific Small Island Developing States said to the UNSC this past July that they all face "potentially catastrophic impacts that threatened to destabilize their societies and institutions. Food and water security, as well as public safety, all were being undermined, which could eventually lead to some islands disappearing altogether, forcing large numbers of peoples to relocate." There is also the impact of lost cultures and languages and ways of life that will be forever lost as people abandon uninhabitable islands to escape the rise in sea level and its accompanying devastation. With the portent of ever increasing serious natural disasters set to plague the region, these island States are begging for intervention.

#### Committee Directive

It is the duty of this body to determine how to contribute to the global need for all Member States to cooperate to mitigate the threat posed by climate change. Therefore, not only is it important to discuss how to slow down and/or halt the process of climate change, this body must be proactive in determining ways to handle the consequences of climate change, such as food shortages, water scarcity, and environmental refugees in order to prevent ensuing conflict. At the moment, the UNFCCC is best prepared to help with the control of climate change, but at the present moment it is ineffective at getting the cooperation of the entire global community. As a non-state actor, climate change knows no boundaries, and thus regional bodies can only do so much to curb the threats discussed here today. The UNSC must also assess the need for the International Legal Commission (ILC) to address potential conflict areas as a result of climate change and its threat to international security by drafting appropriate legislation to deal with such conflict should it occur. Also, there needs to be a determination of the responsibility of the UN in cases such as forced migration and desertification to prevent possible conflict from arising.

# Topic V: Examining Challenges Facing the Development of Nuclear Energy

#### Introduction

On March 11, 2011, a magnitude 8.9 earthquake struck the northeast coast of Japan. The resulting devastation was coupled with a ten meter high tsunami that washed over parts of the island. The loss of life was catastrophic but the effects proved far-reaching. Along with many other infrastructure facilities, the Fukushima Dai-uchi nuclear reactor was damaged. The resulting months saw numerous attempts to contain the radiation leak. 128 The disaster at Fukushima falls in line behind the two most well-known nuclear incidents of all time: the 1979 situation at the 3 Mile Island nuclear plant in Pennsylvania and the accident at Chernobyl in what is now the Ukraine in 1986. 129130 These three events cast a dark pale over the future of nuclear energy especially with concerns to safety. The Fukushima event comes at a terrible time for many nuclear advocates as many reactors especially in the United States are aging, which increases concerns. <sup>131</sup> The recent earthquake along the East Coast of the U.S. which forced two reactors to be shut down is yet another example of this problem. <sup>132</sup> Additional concerns have now appeared. These include concerns over nuclear energy turning into a dangerous two-edged sword. The case of the nuclear

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> Nick Bryant. "Maldives: Paradise soon to be lost." BBC News. July 28, 2004. http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/south\_asia/3930765.stm

<sup>127</sup> Security Council 6587<sup>th</sup> Meeting, 20 July 2011, SC/10332 128 Chris Meyers. "Quake-hit Japan Nuclear Plant Faces Fresh Threat." Reuters News Agency. March 12<sup>th</sup>, 2011. http://www.reuters.com/article/2011/03/12/us-japan-quake-idUSTRE72A0SS20110312

<sup>&</sup>quot;Background on Three Mile Island Accident." United States Nuclear Regulatory Commission. http://www.nrc.gov/readingrm/doc-collections/fact-sheets/3mile-isle.html

<sup>130</sup> Richard Black. "Fukushima: As Bad as Chernobyl?" BBC News. April 12<sup>th</sup>, 2011. http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/science-

environment-13048916

131 Jia Lynn Yang. "Japan quake Puts Spotlight on Aging US Reactors, Cost of Building New Ones." Washington Post. March 16th, 2011. http://www.washingtonpost.com/business/economy/japan-quake-puts-spotlight-on-aging-us-nuclear-reactors-cost-ofbuilding-new-ones/2011/03/16/ABFOiWh story.html

<sup>132</sup> Steven Mufson. "Experts, Activists, Debate Nuclear Safety Following Quake." Washington Times. August 24<sup>th</sup>, 2011. http://www.washingtonpost.com/business/economy/experts-activists-debate-nuclear-power-safety-followingearthquake/2011/08/24/gIQAUG7OcJ story.html.

program in the Islamic Republic of Iran is a prime case as International Atomic Energy Agency (IAEA) inspectors have been denied access and questions over the strict civilian use of the program have been called into question. 133 In this scenario, proliferation of nuclear energy could lead to more States weaponizing their technology. These twin issues thus represent the core of the debate surrounding the development of nuclear energy.

## How Nuclear Energy is Created

Nuclear energy is significantly different from fossil fuels in that the electricity produced does not have harmful effects on our environment. <sup>134</sup> Unlike gas or coal energy, no soot or greenhouse gases are produced. A nuclear power plant generates electricity through radioactive materials. An example of a radioactive material includes uranium. The uranium is placed in a reactor where atoms then begin to split apart. Energy is released as a result of this process, referred to as "fission." During the split, neutrons, which hold atoms together, are thrown off. These neutrons then begin to hit other elements within the reactor. These collisions then cause more atoms to throw off more energy and neutrons. 136 The energy then heats water, at which point the water turns into steam. 137 The next steps in the process are identical to what occurs in a steam power plant. "Steam pushes on turbines, which forces coils of wire to interact with a magnetic field." This process generates an electric current which is ultimately used by the consumer.

## Nuclear Energy's Health Impacts from Disasters

Although nuclear energy has a number of clear benefits, there are grave concerns with past and potential consequences of its use. As noted in the introduction, there have been incidents involving nuclear power plants that have resulted in catastrophic results. The Chernobyl power plant accident killed 30 people and 209 individuals were treated for radiation poisoning. The World Health Organization (WHO) found that the "radiation levels in Scotland, over 1400 miles away from the accident, were 10,000 times the norm." It is believed that thousands of deaths from cancer were a direct result of radiation exposure. 140 The economic downfall can also prove to be daunting. It is estimated that the Chernobyl incident cost the Soviet Union three times the benefit from all their nuclear power plants between 1954 and 1990.141

The 1979 Three Mile Island accident near Middletown, PA, was the most serious nuclear power incident to have occurred within the United States. 142 The pumps that were utilized to remove heat from the plant unexpectedly stopped running. As a result, the pressure within the nuclear part of the plant began to increase, and ultimately needed to be released. This radiation release was estimated to effect approximately 2 million individuals with varying levels of radiation. 143

## Practicality of Investing into Nuclear Power

According to the International Atomic Energy Agency (IAEA), there are a significant and diverse set of stages and resources needed before a State may introduce a nuclear power plant within its borders. "These include development of nuclear policies and regulations, feasibility studies, public consultations, technology evaluation, requests for

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>133</sup> RES 1929 (2010). United Nations Security Council. June 9<sup>th</sup>, 2010. <sup>134</sup> Amit Asaravala. "How Nuclear Power Works." Wired. July 5<sup>th</sup>, 2005. http://www.wired.com/science/discoveries/news/2005/07/68074 136 Ibid. 137 Ibid. 138 Ibid. 139 Ibid. 140 Ibid.

<sup>141</sup> Ibid. 142 "Background on Three Mile Island Accident." United States Nuclear Regulatory Commission. http://www.nrc.gov/reading- $\rm rm/doc\text{-}collections/fact\text{-}sheets/3mile\text{-}isle\text{.}html$   $^{143}$  Ibid.

proposals and evaluations, contracts and financing, supply, construction, commissioning, operation and finally decommissioning."144

The above criteria is only a small subset of all the regulatory and investment needs that a Member State must possess before the creation of a nuclear power plant, which poses greater obstacles for developing nations. "In parts of Africa, there have been critics that there is absence of a culture of maintenance and a lack of engineers to maintain the existing infrastructure, even in non-nuclear electricity plants." <sup>145</sup> According to former Nigerian President Olusegun Obasanjo, due to lack of investment, his country's gas thermal plants and hydropower stations have not been maintained properly since their construction forty years ago. This has led to these stations operating below capacity, which ultimately has affected the ability for stable, reliable power sources to be provided. 146

In addition to the infrastructure challenges, emergency management/preparedness must also be considered. In the past instances where nuclear power plants have leaked radiation and poses potential health problems, it has occurred in developed countries that have agencies and personnel to directly handle threats. <sup>147</sup> These resources are not readily apparent in developing nations. According to the IAEA, "many developing countries underestimate the investment in science, engineering and time required to commission a nuclear reactor. Between 200 and 1,000 scientists and engineers trained in nuclear science are needed to run a nuclear power plant."148

#### Pre-Emptive Actions Taken to Prevent Weapon Development

After nuclear fission occurs, regularly Plutonium remains. Plutonium can be used to assist in creating more energy from nuclear power or it can be used in more harmful ways, such as inclusion in a bomb. 149 If there was no commercial or consumer-energy use for nuclear power, it would be safe to assume that investments into uranium mining and creation of reactors would be for weapons. 150 However, because there are non-weapons uses for nuclear energy, it is not completely clear whether States are actually using it to generate power or as a rouse to potentially create nuclear weapons.

The potential for weapons use has created instances where reactors have been bombed and threats of war have been made against States who have attempted construction of reactors. In June 1981, Israel bombed the French built Osirik reactor in defense of their belief that Iraq was building a nuclear weapon to destroy Israel. 151 This was the first international instance where a State bombed a nuclear reactor. In a statement, the Israeli Government noted. "the atomic bombs which that reactor was capable of producing whether from enriched uranium or from plutonium, would be of the Hiroshima size. Thus a mortal danger to the people of Israel progressively arose." <sup>152</sup> Israel was critical of France and Italy for their involvement in Irag's nuclear reactor production.

#### Rogue Use and Trade of Nuclear Energy

The case study of Abdul Oadeer Khan serves as the best example of the dangers of nuclear proliferation. Dr. Khan was born in British India but soon graduated with a metallurgical degree in the Netherlands. There, he began research on nuclear technologies. In 1975, he was invited by Pakistani leaders to take over the nuclear program that the state was developing at the time. As such, Dr. Khan worked for the Pakistan Atomic Energy Commission (PAEC) as well as Engineering Research Laboratories (ERL) later named after him. He quickly made progress and

http://news.bbc.co.uk/onthisday/hi/dates/stories/june/7/newsid\_3014000/3014623.stm lbid.

<sup>144 &</sup>quot;Basic infrastructure for a nuclear power project." International Atomic Energy Agency. June 2006. http://wwwpub.iaea.org/mtcd/publications/pdf/te\_1513\_web.pdf

145 Alex Abutu. "Is Africa ready for safe nuclear power." Scidev.net. March 17 2011.

<sup>146</sup> Ibid.

<sup>147</sup> Ibid.

<sup>148</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>149</sup> Leslie Lai. "Nuclear Energy Fact Sheet." Nuclear Age Peace Foundation. <a href="http://www.wagingpeace.org/menu/issues/nuclear-">http://www.wagingpeace.org/menu/issues/nuclear-</a> energy-&-waste/nuclear-energy-fact-sheet.htm

150 "Nuclear Power and Nuclear Weapons." Nuclear Energy Information Service.

http://www.neis.org/literature/Brochures/weapcon.htm

<sup>151 &</sup>quot;1981: Israel bombs Baghdad nuclear reactor." BBC News.

he would be the primary catalyst for the South Asian state's successful nuclear test in 1998.<sup>153</sup> Nevertheless, his work apparently took a highly dangerous turn when he began selling technology to other states. At least five countries met with Khan and the full revelation of his black market dealings is unknown. Among the products Khan marketed was training for domestic scientists, blueprints, even supplies.<sup>154</sup>

The questionable nuclear programs of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea (DPRK), Iran and Libya have all been linked to his illegal activities. Khan himself had to assembly the Pakistani program in pieces and continued to operate a nuclear parts business after his domestic success. It got so expansive that IAEA Director Mohammed El-Baradei stated that Khan ran the, ""Wal-Mart of private-sector proliferation." In 2003, a German ship was seized by Italian authorities who found one thousand centrifuges bound for the North African state of Libya. This would mark the end of what is commonly referred to as the "A.Q. Khan Network." The most worrisome aspect of this problem is that his actions were never stopped by domestic authorities or caught in the international system. Documents trace the beginnings of these dealings back more than a decade. Additionally, there remains real concern that non-state actors may have also met with Khan most notably elements allied with Al Qaeda and other Islamic extremist groups.

## Committee Directive

This particular topic poses many significant questions for the committee at large. The question of developing new nuclear technology is a divisive issue and the questions posed by its challenges create numerous avenues for work in the committee. First, how can the UNSC work to make nuclear energy safer? The accidents mentioned above cannot be ignored by the international community. At the same time, worldwide energy pressures look to more efficient and cleaner forms of energy production. Thus, delegates must balance the two sides and find a solution.

The second primary question within this topic is whether developing states should even have access to nuclear technology lest another A.Q. Khan Network appear. As one can see from that example, the dangers of proliferation even by one group can have devastating consequences for regional and global dynamics. At the same time, the technology is already widespread and the goal is not to necessarily limit the use of nuclear technology but to make the proliferation more secure and more easily monitored. Delegates should also seek to find common ground on the issue of nuclear energy technology to developing states.

The last question for the UNSC is how to work more closely to other agencies to prevent accidents like those that occurred under Khan's work. Libya's voluntary end to their controversial nuclear program can serve as an example of what the UNSC should be looking for as it ended a potential weapon program and helped close the door on the nuclear black market.

http://www.carnegieendowment.org/static/npp/Khan Chronology.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>153</sup> "A.Q Khan Nuclear Technology." Carniege Endowment for International Peace.

<sup>154 &</sup>quot;Nonproliferation: The Pakistan Network." Council of Foreign Relations. http://www.cfr.org/nonlethal-weapons/nonproliferation-pakistan-network/p7751
155 Ibid.

<sup>156 &</sup>quot;Weapons of Mass Destruction: A.Q. Khan Network." Global Security. http://www.globalsecurity.org/wmd/world/pakistan/khan.htm

# **Technical Appendix Guide (TAG)**

## **Topic I: Cyber Warfare**

"DOD Announces First U.S. Cyber Command and First U.S. CYBERCOM Commander." United States Department of Defense. <a href="http://www.defense.gov/releases/release.aspx?releaseid=13551">http://www.defense.gov/releases/release.aspx?releaseid=13551</a>

This is an important resource as it allows Delegates to learn more about how a leading Member State in cyber security has normalized cyber safety within its defense operations.

"Convention on Cybercrime." Council of Europe. <a href="http://conventions.coe.int/Treaty/en/Treaties/html/185.htm">http://conventions.coe.int/Treaty/en/Treaties/html/185.htm</a>
The Convention on Cybercrime is the first international treaty on crimes committed on the internet and other computer networks. The primary goal of the Treaty is to "pursue a common criminal policy aimed at the protection of society against cybercrime, especially by adopting appropriate legislation and fostering international cooperation."

## **Topic II: Addressing the Security Situation in Middle East**

"Arab Uprising" BBC News. http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-middle-east-12813859

This news website offers complete coverage on all aspects of the Arab Spring. The timelines and country profiles provide solid background material and the articles are organized for easy searching. More importantly, BBC News has carried the coverage of the protests fairly. This website is highly recommended as new developments occur so that students can stay informed ahead of the conference.

"News Focus: Winds of Change: North Africa and the Middle East." United Nations.

http://www.un.org/apps/news/infocusRel.asp?infocusID=129&Body=North+Africa&Body1=change

The United Nations News Centre provides many good sources on the Arab Spring and this website organizes them
all in an easy to search format. Additionally, it does not just cover the issue of the Arab Spring but also of South
Sudan-Sudan crisis and the situation in Somalia. This site should be checked regularly by delegates in order to keep
track of what the UN is saying about breaking development.

"Security Council Committee established pursuant to resolution 1970 (2011) concerning the Libyan Arab Jamahiriya." United Nations Security Council Sanctions Committee. http://www.un.org/sc/committees/1970/.

This website is home to the sanctions committee set up in response to the government crackdown against protesters in Libya. This particular aspect of the crisis is still relatively new, but the sanctions are being evaluated by a panel of experts who are posting findings to the Security Council and can be found on this website. Delegates are encouraged to examine reports from the panel of experts as this remains an active topic. Additionally, their work may help with other situations around the Middle East.

# **Topic III: Examining the Practicality and Effectiveness of Sanctions**

"United Nations Security Council Sanctions Committees." United Nations Security Council. http://www.un.org/sc/committees/.

For a complete understanding of sanctions, a full review of how they were implemented is important. This website provides just that. It focuses on all committees set up to handle sanctions handed out in the last twenty years. Additionally, it provides background on the results of those sanctions. Only two committees remain active and those help complete the narrative.

Kimberly Ann Elliot, et al. "Sanctions." The Concise Encyclopedia of Economics. http://www.econlib.org/library/Enc/Sanctions.html.

This article from the Concise Encyclopedia of Economics provides an excellent overview of the state of sanctions, most notably the problems associated with them. It particularly addresses the issue of effectiveness and delegates are encouraged to take many of those points into consideration when building their ideas. Additionally, the article mentions many avenues that can be researched further.

"The Special Program on the Implementation of Targeted Sanctions." Uppsala University. http://www.smartsanctions.se/.

The Department of Peace and Conflict Research at Uppsala University in Sweden manage this website which provides details on the Stockholm Process. Not only does it cover the basics of what targeted sanctions are and how they are designed to work, the site also includes recent news and opinions. This website is extremely important for delegates looking to improve the effectiveness of sanctions through "smart sanctions." Finally, the site has numerous references to other resources and helpful links for continued research.

## **Topic IV: Climate Change and International Security**

"Security Council Holds First-Ever Debate on Impact of Climate Change." United Nations Security Council. 17 April 2007. http://www.un.org/News/Press/docs/2007/sc9000.doc.htm

This is an important resources as it allows delegates to see how the Security Council first viewed the issue of climate change in relation to security of Member States. At the time, some delegations questioned whether the Security Council had a role while other Small Island States were adamant about the relationship.

"Energy, Security, and Climate UN Documents." Security Council Report. 18 June 2008. http://www.securitycouncilreport.org/site/c.glKWLeMTIsG/b.4211099/

This is an excellent resource for delegates as it lists a wealth of documents regarding the topic. It includes selected Security Council Resolutions, debates, letters, and Secretary-General Reports on areas related to the topic.

# Topic V: Examining Challenges Facing the Development of Nuclear Energy

"Fact Sheet on the United Nations Security Council Summit on Nuclear Nonproliferation and Nuclear Disarmament." The White House, Office of the Press Secretary. September 24, 2009. <a href="http://www.whitehouse.gov/the\_press\_office/Fact-Sheet-on-the-United-Nations-Security-Council-Summit-on-Nuclear-Nonproliferation-and-Nuclear-Disarmament-UNSC-Resolution-1887/">http://www.whitehouse.gov/the\_press\_office/Fact-Sheet-on-the-United-Nations-Security-Council-Summit-on-Nuclear-Nonproliferation-and-Nuclear-Disarmament-UNSC-Resolution-1887/</a>

This fact sheet gives delegates a foundation of work on the issue of Nuclear energy completed in the past few years by the Security Council. Specifically, UNSC Resolution 1887 which discusses concern about the threat of nuclear proliferations and the need for further international attention. This resolution was adopted unanimously committing all involved to the creation of a framework which reduces nuclear dangers and eliminates nuclear weapons worldwide.

Marshall, Brian. "How Nuclear Power Works." How Stuff Works. <a href="http://science.howstuffworks.com/nuclear-power1.htm">http://science.howstuffworks.com/nuclear-power1.htm</a>

How Stuff Works is a website that explains in easy to digest pieces fairly complicated issues. This specific reference item gives an excellent explanation of how nuclear power works, starting from the reactor to how it reaches your home. Delegates should focus on sections one through four, as sections five and six focus more on policy (which is covered extensively throughout the guide and the footnotes).

International Atomic Energy Agency. <a href="http://www.iaea.org/">http://www.iaea.org/</a>

The International Atomic Energy Agency (IAEA) is the United Nations body (regulated by a special agreement) charged with promoting "safe, secure, and peaceful nuclear technologies." The IAEA Secretariat is composed of more than 2,300 staff members who work towards fulfilling the goals of peaceful compliance of developing and use nuclear technologies. Their website has a myriad of resources, including information on Conferences, publications on standards/guides, and fact sheets to assist delegates with their research.